

Monitoring Report

Visit Date	20-04-2016
Report Submitted	

- 1). **Name of Project:** Retrofitting of Sports Stadium Muzaffarabad
- 2). **Sector:** Sports, Youth & Culture
- 3). **Sub-Sector:** Sports, Youth & Culture
- 4). **Unique Ref. No:** SPO-217
- 5). **Location:** Muzaffarabad

District	Tehsil	Constituency	Village/Town Committee
Muzaffarabad	Muzaffarabad	Muzaffarabad	Muzaffarabad

- 6). **Status:**

On-Going		Completed
✓ Original	Revised	Work in progress
98.785	-	

- 7). (a) **Time Line:**

As per PC-I			Approved Duration of Project (Months)	As per Admin Approval	
Actual	Date of Approval	Date of Completion		Start Date	Completion Date
	13-05-2015	12-05 2017	24 Month	28-08-2015	12-05-2017
Revised (last)	-	-	-	-	-

- (b) **Time Over:** No

- 8). **Cost:**

Amount	Actual	1st Revised	2nd Revised	3rd Revised	4th Revised	5 th Revised
	98.785 million					
Date	13-05-2015					

9). (a) Project History

Year	Phasing as per PC-I	Actual PSDP Provision/Releases	Utilization
2015-16	49.532	18.000/15.046	13.014

(b) Reasons if funds are not released:

Lack of ADP Allocation

(10). Financial Progress:

S#	Activities as per PC-I	Approved Cost as per PC-I	Cumulative Exp. up to the last financial year	Expenditure During Current Financial Year		
				Allocation	Releases	Utilization
1	2	3	4	5	6	7
	Civil Work	73.592	0.000			12.43
	Cost Escalation (2 nd Year 6.5% of civil work)	2.093	0.000			0.000
	Work Charges 1.5% of Civil Work (for PP&H) Department	1.151	0.000			0.000
	Contingency 2% of Civil Work (For sports Department)	1.535	0.300			0.300
	Staff Salaries	6.557	0.000			0.000
	Furniture & Equipments for Sports Stadium	9.539	0.000			0.000
	Charges for CDO to arrange investigation 7 design @ 0.5% of Civil Work.	3.550	0.000			0.284
	Investigation Measure for Environmental Degradation occurred during the construction of Retrofitting of project (1% of Civil Work)	0.768	0.000			0.000
	Total	98.785	0.300	18.000	15.046	13.014

11). Physical Progress: (Quantitative)

Activities of Work	Unit	Quantity	Cumulative Physical Achievement up to end of last financial year.	Physical Target Achieved During Current Financial Year	
				Planned	Achieved
1	2	3	4	5	6
Retrofitting of Existing Structures	Sft	32185	-	-	-
Boundary wall	Rft	960	-	-	-
Ring & Approach Road	Rft	700	-	-	-
Strom Water Drainage	Rft	1500	-	1500	1350
Footpath & Walk Way	Rft	1440	-	-	-
Retaining wall/Breast Walls	Rft	500	-	500	415
External Water Supply & Fountain	Rft	2000	-	-	-
External Electrification (Street Light etc.)	Nos	22	-	-	-
Cricket Pitches	Nos	02	-	-	-
Improvement & Up-Gradation of Existing Ground	sft	114453	-	-	-
Seating Steps	sft	12250	-	-	-
Parking	sft	15300	-	-	-
CGI Roofing with Steel Structure	sft	5500	-	5500	4200
Furniture & Equipments for Sports Stadium	Nos	1023	-	-	-

12). Supervision of Work:

Name of PD /Responsible officer	Ch. Tayyab
Designation	Director General
Full time/Additional Charge	Full Time
Contacts	
Office	05822-921568
Residence	-
Cell	0344-4455508
Fax	05822-921288

13: Project description

- i. The scheme “Retrofitting of Sports Stadium Muzaffarabad” was approved by the AKDWP in its meeting held on 11-12th March 2015 at the cost of Rs.98.785 million. Main objective of the project is retrofitting / restrengthening of the stadium which was damaged due to earthquake 2005. PC-I of the scheme comprises of two major components: A) Retrofitting of existing structure B) External development.
- ii. An amount of Rs.0.384 million was provided in approved PC-I against the head “charges for CDO to arrange investigation & design of civil work”. The CDO pointed out that the detailed design/drawing will be possible after having all the data including soil investigation /geotechnical study, concrete testing etc. As such CDO has demanded Rs.3.550 million instead of Rs.0.384 million for the above job. In this regard position paper has been approved by the AKDWP on 11-12th March 2015 for increasing CDO charges for investigation & designing from Rs. 0.384 million to Rs.3.550 million .The additional amount will be shifted from the head civil works within overall approved cost of the project.
- iii. The detailed design/drawing for retrofitting work has not so far been finalized by CDO. Therefore the Sports Deptt. started the work on component B of PC-I i.e

External Development. Retrofitting work will be started soon after getting the detailed design from CDO.



Views of sports stadium

14: Purpose of Monitoring

A citizen resident of Naloochi District Muzaffarabad submitted application to the Chief Secretary regarding substandard works of the project “Retrofitting of Sports Stadium Muzaffarabad”.

Following points regarding substandard work were raised in the Application.

- i. The work of retaining wall is not up to the mark, material used in the wall is substandard. Septic sewerage water is coming from Kashmir Council / Income Tax Colony and making pond along back side of the wall which is dangerous for retaining wall.
- ii. The work of CGI roofing of VIP enclosure in Pavilion is also not up to the mark. Substandard and low quality material is being used in roofing work which cannot face the wind load.
- iii. The drain is not properly functioning, water in drain is stopped and making smell and is hazardous.

In light of directions of the Secretary Planning & Development, the subject scheme was monitored on 20-04-2016. Findings and recommendations are given accordingly.

15: Findings with reference to complaints:

i. Complaint Regarding Protection Work/Retaining Wall:

- a. The work of Retaining Wall 500 Rft along outer periphery of stadium is near completion, 415 Rft wall has been completed.
- b. Height and width of retaining wall was checked at site.
- c. As per PC-1 and work order, retaining wall of plum concrete with specification i.e P/L plum concrete Lawrence pur sand and crushed aggregate 1-1/2 inch and down guage with 30% boulder including leveling compacting and curing(1:3:6) is to be constructed at site. Hence accordingly at site 415 Rft wall has been constructed out of total 500 Rft wall as per aproved PC1.
- d. At this stage, after construction of retaining wall complaints raised in application regarding approved ratio as per specification, use of sub-standard material and quality of retaining wall, cannot be checked/verified. However, as per visual inspection quality of wall seemed satisfactory only minor honey combing was observed at some points.
- e. Complaint raised in application regarding construction of retaining wall on unnecessary place/ side also seems not justified. As per site inspection it has been observed that retaining wall is constructed along the outer periphery where steps/sitting, landscaping and at top 10 feet path (for advertisement agencies) has been kept within the stadium. All other sides round the stadium are covered with pavilion/shops. No other space/choice is available round the stadium for construction of retaining wall. Besides 30 feet wide circular road has been proposed around the stadium as per design
- f. As per site examination, it has been observed that as the construction of stadium was in progress during earthquake of 2005, the retaining wall of stone masonry in the remaining portion is in better condition which can be made structurally safe with minor retrofitting

as per opinion of CDO, hence scope of retaining wall may be reduced to work done level i.e 415 Rft in consultation with the CDO.

- g. Complaint raised in application that retaining wall has been constructed in front of existing stone masonry. Retaining wall was also examined w.r.t site and it has been observed that 100 Rft plum concrete retaining wall has been constructed along the face of existing stone masonry wall but condition/quality of stone masonry wall cannot be assessed because whole wall is not visible clearly. However, SDO Sports Department informed that it has been constructed as per recommendations of CDO.



Retaining Wall

- h. Along the external face of retaining wall ponding of sewerage/rain water was observed at site proposed for road which may be dangerous for the safety of the newly constructed retaining wall. The SDO Sports Department informed that this sewerage and septic water is coming from Income Tax Colony located adjacent to stadium at eastern side. The SDO told that Income Tax Department was conveyed in writing to stop this septic sewerage water but no action was taken from them. However, there is dire to improve existing drain along with the new constructed wall so that sewer and rain water is safely drained in to major drain constructed for the stadium.



Ponding of sewerage and rain water

- i. Provision of stone masonry retaining wall is included in approved PC-I. But at site plum concrete wall has been constructed. The sponsors showed the same cross-section for plum concrete wall at site with hand written specification which was also signed by the Deputy Director CDO.

ii Complaint regarding Corrugated Galvanized Iron (CGI) Roofing with Steel

Structure:

- a. Issue raised in application regarding quality of steel framing may be justified. Keeping in view the earthquake parameter and wind loads, this type of truss cannot safe/durable. Because at site complete steel framing was done with MS hollow pipes contrary to the similar nature truss constructed in Rawalakot stadium based on proper design for trusses.
- b. Work of steel framework for roofing was almost completed and CGI fixing was in progress
- c. As per work order for steel framework of VIP enclosure, trusses angle iron, Mild Steel pipe etc. has been mentioned whereas hollow MS pipes are only used at site.



CGI Roofing with Steel Structure

iii Complaint regarding Storm Water Drainage:

- I. Internal drain is not properly functioning; water in drain is stopped and making smell and hazard to the environment due to the following reasons:
 - a) Work on internal drain, boundary wall and other external development component has not so far been started.
 - b) Work on storm water drainage has been stopped because local people have filed the case in the court that the storm water is causing erosion of land which is dangerous for houses of the area.



Storm water drainage

The SDO Sports Department informed that storm water drainage will be connected with the drain constructed by MCDP. But at disposal point of drain to the river, sliding of land has been

observed which is continuous threat to the land/houses of the people. Some protection work was done by MCDP which was also eroded.



Protection work at disposal point being eroded

16 Recommendations/ required action to be taken by the Department.

- i. The position paper has been approved by the AKDWP for increasing provision of detailed design/drawing from Rs.0.384 million to Rs.3.550 million. As such the Sports Department should release the funds to CDO urgently and get the designing from CDO to start retrofitting work of the stadium.
- ii. Ponding of sewerage/rain water be drained out by the Department at the earliest to ensure safety of newly constructed retaining wall.
- iii. Angle iron truss is approved for roofing work as per design in PC-I whereas hollow MS pipes are used at site. Responsibility may be fixed for deviation from approved design of roofing work without consent of the competent authority which led to sub-standard work.
- iv. Design of steel framed structure for CGI roofing be reviewed by CDO keeping in view the earthquake/wind load. Otherwise CDO may certify/mention that this structure would be safe and strong enough to bear the earthquake and wind load.
- v. Case filed in the Court regarding construction of storm water drainage be vigorously pursued to get it vacated as soon as possible.
- vi. Internal drainage work should also be started to dispose of the dirty/stopped water in drain.

- vii. MCDP must be approached to ensure that drain is immediately started by the MDCP as planned to avoid any encumbrance by the local people.

17. Reporting Team P&DD

Name	Designation	Signature	Date
Muhammad Tariq Khan	Chief Sports Youth & Culture		
Eng. Muhammad Fahim	Assistant Director		